Nguyen Ngoc Thach Nguyen Duc Trung Doan Thanh Ha Vladik Kreinovich *Editors*

Partial Identification in Econometrics and Related Topics



Studies in Systems, Decision and Control

Volume 531

Series Editor

Janusz Kacprzyk, Systems Research Institute, Polish Academy of Sciences, Warsaw, Poland

Editorial Board

Dmitry A. Novikov, Institute of Control Sciences (Director), Russian Academy of Sciences, Moscow, Russia

Peng Shi, School of Electrical and Mechanical Engineering, University of Adelaide, Adelaide, Australia

Jinde Cao, School of Mathematics, Southeast University, Nanijing, China Marios Polycarpou, KIOS Research Center, University of Cyprus, Nicosia, Cyprus Witold Pedrycz, Faculty of Engineering, University of Alberta, Alberta, Canada The series "Studies in Systems, Decision and Control" (SSDC) covers both new developments and advances, as well as the state of the art, in the various areas of broadly perceived systems, decision making and control-quickly, up to date and with a high quality. The intent is to cover the theory, applications, and perspectives on the state of the art and future developments relevant to systems, decision making, control, complex processes and related areas, as embedded in the fields of engineering, computer science, physics, economics, social and life sciences, as well as the paradigms and methodologies behind them. The series contains monographs, textbooks, lecture notes and edited volumes in systems, decision making and control spanning the areas of Cyber-Physical Systems, Autonomous Systems, Sensor Networks, Control Systems, Energy Systems, Automotive Systems, Biological Systems, Vehicular Networking and Connected Vehicles, Aerospace Systems, Automation, Manufacturing, Smart Grids, Nonlinear Systems, Power Systems, Robotics, Social Systems, Economic Systems and other. Of particular value to both the contributors and the readership are the short publication timeframe and the worldwide distribution and exposure which enable both a wide and rapid dissemination of research output.

Indexed by SCOPUS, DBLP, WTI Frankfurt eG, zbMATH, SCImago.

All books published in the series are submitted for consideration in Web of Science.

Nguyen Ngoc Thach · Nguyen Duc Trung · Doan Thanh Ha · Vladik Kreinovich Editors

Partial Identification in Econometrics and Related Topics



Editors
Nguyen Ngoc Thach
Ho Chi Minh University of Banking
Ho Chi Minh City, Vietnam

Doan Thanh Ha Ho Chi Minh University of Banking Ho Chi Minh City, Vietnam Nguyen Duc Trung Ho Chi Minh University of Banking Ho Chi Minh City, Vietnam

Vladik Kreinovich Department of Computer Science University of Texas at El Paso El Paso, TX, USA

ISSN 2198-4182 ISSN 2198-4190 (electronic) Studies in Systems, Decision and Control ISBN 978-3-031-59109-9 ISBN 978-3-031-59110-5 (eBook) https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-031-59110-5

© The Editor(s) (if applicable) and The Author(s), under exclusive license to Springer Nature Switzerland AG 2024

This work is subject to copyright. All rights are solely and exclusively licensed by the Publisher, whether the whole or part of the material is concerned, specifically the rights of translation, reprinting, reuse of illustrations, recitation, broadcasting, reproduction on microfilms or in any other physical way, and transmission or information storage and retrieval, electronic adaptation, computer software, or by similar or dissimilar methodology now known or hereafter developed.

The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use.

The publisher, the authors and the editors are safe to assume that the advice and information in this book are believed to be true and accurate at the date of publication. Neither the publisher nor the authors or the editors give a warranty, expressed or implied, with respect to the material contained herein or for any errors or omissions that may have been made. The publisher remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.

This Springer imprint is published by the registered company Springer Nature Switzerland AG The registered company address is: Gewerbestrasse 11, 6330 Cham, Switzerland

If disposing of this product, please recycle the paper.

Preface

To make proper investments in economy, we need to have a good understanding of the future trends: how will demand change, how will prices change, etc. In general, in science, the usual way to make predictions is:

- to identify a model that best fits the current dynamics, and then
- to use this model to predict the future behavior.

In many practical situations—especially in economics—our past experiences are limited. As a result, we can only achieve a partial identification. It is therefore important to be able to make predictions based on such partially identified models—which is the main focus of this book.

This volume emphasizes partial identification techniques, but it also describes and uses other econometric techniques, ranging from more traditional statistical techniques to more innovative ones such as game-theoretic approach, interval techniques, and machine learning. Applications range from a general analysis of GDP growth, stock market, and consumer prices to analysis of specific sectors of economics (credit and banking, energy, health, labor, tourism, international trade) to specific issues affecting economies such as ecology, national culture, government regulations, and the existence of shadow economy. Papers presented in this volume also cover data processing techniques, with economic and financial application being the unifying theme.

This volume shows what has been achieved, but even more important are the remaining open problems. We hope that this volume will:

- inspire practitioners to learn how to apply state-of-the-art techniques, especially techniques of optimal transport statistics, to economic and financial problems, and
- inspire researchers to further improve the existing techniques and to come up with new techniques for studying economic and financial phenomena.

We want to thank all the authors for their contributions and all anonymous referees for their thorough analysis and helpful comments.

vi Preface

The publication of this volume—and organization of the conference at which these papers were presented—was supported:

- by the Ho Chi Minh University of Banking (HUB), Vietnam, and
- by the Vingroup Innovation Foundation (VINIF).

Our thanks to the leadership and staff of HUB and VINIF for providing crucial support.

Our special thanks to Prof. Hung T. Nguyen for his valuable advice and constant support.

We would also like to thank Prof. Janusz Kacprzyk (Series Editor) and Dr. Thomas Ditzinger (Senior Editor, Engineering/Applied Sciences) for their support and cooperation with this publication.

Ho Chi Minh City, Vietnam Ho Chi Minh City, Vietnam Ho Chi Minh City, Vietnam El Paso, USA December 2023 Nguyen Ngoc Thach Nguyen Duc Trung Doan Thanh Ha Vladik Kreinovich

Contents

Theoretical Results

Hung T. Nguyen

Woraphon Yamaka

Matteo Barigozzi and Marc Hallin

Models of Firm Dynamics and the Hazard Rate of Exits: Reconciling Theory and Evidence Using Non-proportional Hazard Regression Models Arnab Bhattacharjee and Swagatam Sen	25
Extending Jaynes: How Disagreements in Science and Economics Arise	49
The Outcomes of Generative AI Are Exactly the Nash Equilibria of a Non-potential Game Boualem Djehiche and Hamidou Tembine	57

Uncertainty and Decision-Making in Crop Economics Using Fuzzy Hypersoft Set with MULTIMOORA Method and Machine

Muhammad Saglain, Poom Kumam, and Wiyada Kumam

Tho M. Nguyen, Saeid Tizpaz-Niari, and Vladik Kreinovich

Learning

On Ambiguity Arising from Partially Identified Models

Application of Neural Network with Extreme Learning Machine

Dynamic Factor Models: A Genealogy

81

99

109

viii Contents

How to Deal with Inconsistent Intervals: Utility-Based Approach Can Overcome the Limitations of the Purely Probability-Based Approach	135
Kittawit Autchariyapanitkul, Tomoe Entani, Olga Kosheleva, and Vladik Kreinovich	133
How to Make Machine Learning Financial Recommendations More Fair: Theoretical Explanation of Empirical Results Tho M. Nguyen, Saeid Tizpaz-Niari, and Vladik Kreinovich	147
Gain-Probability Analysis of Skew t Distribution Tingting Tong, Tonghui Wang, S. T. Boris Choy, David Trafimow, and Xiangfei Chen	153
Practical Applications	
Disaggregated Energy Use and GDP Growth Nexus Revisited: A Comparison Between Thoughtful and Naïve Bayesian	171
Estimations Nguyen Ngoc Thach and Phan Thi Lieu	171
Foreign Direct Investment and Innovation Activities of Vietnamese Small and Medium Enterprises Dao Le Kieu Oanh, Do Thi Thanh Nhan, Nguyen Tran Xuan Linh, and Hong Thu Nguyen	181
Small-Sample Bayesian Analysis of Environment, Income, Internet and Happiness Nexus Amid COVID-19 Pandemic Ong Van Nam, Nguyen Ngoc Thach, and Nguyen Minh Hai	195
Partial Least Squares for SARS-CoV-2 Risk Perception on Intention to Engage in Online Workout Nguyen Ngoc Long, Le Thi Thanh Truc, Bui Huy Khoi, and Nguyen Ngoc Thach	207
Impact of Income Diversification on Vietnamese Bank Performance: Evidence from Bayesian Approach Dao Le Kieu Oanh and Duong Quynh Nga	221
Impact of COVID-19 on Listed Company Operating Performance Duong Quynh Nga and Dao Le Kieu Oanh	241
Modelling Decision Making Uncertainty and Contextuality	253
A Bayesian Linear Regression Approach to Consumers' Intention to Purchase Second-Hand Clothing Dam Tri Cuong, Nguyen Ngoc Thach, and Bui Huy Khoi	267

Evaluating the Capital Asset Pricing Model for the Moroccan Stock Exchange Smaaine Ouaharahe, Youness Saoudi, Moulay El Mehdi Falloul, Khalid Jeaab, El Mehdi Ferrouhi, and Hanaa Hachimi	277
Factors Affecting Loan Loss Provisions of Vietnamese Commercial Banks: A Bayesian Approach Nam Hai Pham	293
DCC-GARCH Using Histogram Valued Time Series in Asian Countries Wilawan Srichaikul, Worrawat Saijai, and Somsak Chanaim	309
Exploring the Dynamic Correlations Between Stock Market Indexes and Exchange Rates: During- And Post-Crisis Insights from USA, Japan, China, England, and Thailand Worrawat Saijai, Nachattapong Kaewsompong, and Sukrit Thongkairat	325
Effect of Oil Price on Return on Assets and Z-Score of Commercial Banks in Vietnam: A Bayesian Random-Effect Panel Data Model	343
Globalization, Economic Freedom, and the Shadow Economy in ASEAN Countries: Insights from Bayesian Modeling Pham Xuan Thu, Nguyen Ngoc Thach, Nguyen Van Diep, and Nguyen Huynh Mai Tram	363
How Does Government Support Affect Firm Performance? Evidence from WBES Dataset Quynh Trang Phan, Ngoc Thach Nguyen, and Van Diep Nguyen	383
Factors Affecting Capital Adequacy Ratio of the Commercial Bank in Vietnam Do Thi Ha Thuong, Doan Thanh Ha, Bui Dan Thanh, and Nguyen Hong Ngoc	399
Evidence from the Behavior of Subordinated Creditors on the Market Discipline	417
Heterogeneous Impact of Tourism Development, and Economic Growth on Ecological Footprint in Singapore Bui Hoang Ngoc, Nguyen Huynh Mai Tram, Canh Chi Hoang, Nguyen Ngoc Thach, and Bui Hong Dang	437
DEA-RNNs: An Ensemble Approach for Portfolio Selection in the Thailand Stock Market Mojtaba Safari, Nawapon Nakharutai, Phisanu Chiawkhun, and Parkpoom Phetpradap	453

x Contents

Efficiency of the ASEAN-5 Stock Markets: A Markov-Switching Model Estimation Using Adjusted Market Inefficiency Magnitude Paravee Maneejuk, Somsak Chanaim, and Wilawan Srichaikul	469
How to Improve the Logistics Performance Index Nguyen Thi Ngoc Diep, Tran Quang Canh, and Nguyen Ngoc Thach	481
The Impact of the Economic, Societal and Environmental Factors on Sustainable Trade of a Country Tran Quang Canh, Nguyen Thi Ngoc Diep, and Nguyen Ngoc Thach	495
Application of Bayesian Algorithm for Selecting a Healthcare Facility Bui Huy Khoi, Dam Tri Cuong, and Nguyen Ngoc Thach	509
National Culture and Shadow Economy in OECD Countries: A Bayesian Approach Nguyen Ngoc Thach, Phan Thi Minh Hue, Duong Tien Ha My, and Pham Xuan Thu	527
The Impact of the Monetary Policy on the Household Sector in Vietnam: Bayesian DSGE Model Approach Trieu Kim Lanh, Nguyen Duc Trung, Tran Tho Dat, and Le Hoang Anh	545
Factors Affecting Purchase Intention to Food Products of Gen Z in Vietnam Nguyen Thi Phuong Giang, Nguyen Binh Phuong Duy, Le Huu Hung, Thai Dong Tan, and Nguyen Huynh Ngoc Nhu	565
Factors Affecting the Credit Growth of Vietnamese Commercial Banks in the Post-global Economic Crisis Nguyen Van Dan, Ha Van Dung, Dang Truong Thanh Nhan, and Pham Hai Nam	577
Hybrid ARIMA and Machine Learning Approach for the VND/ USD Exchange Rate Prediction in Vietnam: A Comparative Analysis Nguyen Anh Tu, Dau Dinh Khoa, Nguyen Cao Thien Nhan, and Dao Le Kieu Oanh	587
The Effect of Firm Size on Its Productivity: Evidence from Vietnamese Small and Medium Enterprises Truong Thanh Nhan Dang, Van Dung Ha, Van Tung Nguyen, and Van Dan Nguyen	605
The Impact of Internet Usage on the Labor Market in Vietnam Thuong Thi Vu, Thang Tat Vo, and Chon Van Le	619

Contents xi

The Impact of Non-interest Income on Vietnamese Bank Performance Dao Le Kieu Oanh, Nguyen Hoang Vinh Loc, and Duong Quynh Nga	635
Does Renewable Energy Minimize Greenhouse Gas Emissions in Asia? Evidence from the Bayesian Approach Tho M. Nguyen and Worrawat Saijai	653
Willingness to Pay for Ready-to-Eat Quinoa Products Among Consumers in Thailand Chatchai Khiewngamdee, Supreeya Wangsathian, Terdthiti Chitkasame, and Nachattapong Kaewsompong	671
The Relationship Between Macroprudential Policy and Financial Spillovers in Southeast Asia in the Last Two Decades	687
Application of Artificial Neural Network in Forecasting Economic Growth in Ho Chi Minh City Le Hoang Anh and Tuyen Luu Nguyen	703
University-Enterprise Linkages: A Bayesian SEM Approach Toward MIS Major	719

Evidence from the Behavior of Subordinated Creditors on the Market Discipline



Le Ngoc Quynh Anh

Abstract This paper evaluates the potential role of subordinated creditors in enhancing market discipline. The following conclusions were drawn in the paper: (i) The study demonstrates that subordinated creditors would impose sanctions on banks that exhibit high levels of risk, notably credit risk and market risk; (ii) Our research reveals indications of a deterioration in discipline when banks are subject to regulatory scrutiny, particularly in developing market banks. (iii) The study's findings highlight the reasons why banks do not report bank risks in accordance with the Basel III framework's third pillar. For bank managers, politicians, and supervisors, our findings have ramifications. Overall, this study is the first effort to use the LASSO regression model to evaluate the subordinated creditors' discipline under new capital and liquidity regulations. This study is also the first to look at how four distinct risk categories affect the discipline of subordinated creditors (as needed by the Basel regulatory framework to increase transparency).

Keywords Subordinated creditors' discipline \cdot Basel III \cdot Bank risk \cdot Capital and liquidity regulation

1 Introduction

According to the evaluation research "McKinsey's Global Banking Annual Review, 2021" of S&P Global Ratings, the common feature of banks in emerging countries in the Asia-Pacific region is that they appear to be quite strong and developed on the surface. However, a closer look shows that the disparity is quite large between banks. These banks are facing the challenges of mature markets, including slowing growth, declining profitability, and higher capital requirements. In many cases, they need to grow to increase their competitive position. Specifically, for banks in emerging economies in the Asia-Pacific region, annual revenue growth slowed down to 5% and

L. N. Q. Anh (⊠)

University of Economics, Hue University, Hue, Vietnam

e-mail: lengocquynhanh@hueuni.edu.vn

nations in the Asia-Pacific area have varying degrees of influence. When comparing banks in the group of developing and developed nations, the analysis's findings indicate that there are both parallels and variations when it comes to the discipline of subordinated creditors. However, it is clear that the subordinated creditors in the group of developing nations respond to the risk profile of banks more strongly than those in the group of industrialized nations. Additionally, achieving Basel III's capital and liquidity requirements generally has a beneficial effect on the group of developing nations and boosts the trust of subordinated creditors more than it does for the group of developed nations. This outcome demonstrates the impact of Basel III compliance and enforcement in both sets of nations, particularly emerging nations, on the trust and lack of discipline among subordinated creditors.

Our findings have several important implications: (1) Assist regulators in formulating risk management plans for banks and ensuring they meet Basel III liquidity and capital requirements. Market discipline has weakened, and bank regulators must compensate by increasing their monitoring responsibilities. (2) The study's findings, in particular, underline the reasons why banks ignore the third pillar of the Basel III framework's obligations for the disclosure of bank risks.

Acknowledgements The research is funded by Hue University, Vietnam (DHH2024-06-146).

References

- Abbas, F., Iqbal, S., Aziz, B.: The impact of bank capital, bank liquidity and credit risk on profitability in postcrisis period: a comparative study of US and Asia. Cogent Econ. Finance (2019). https://doi.org/10.1080/23322039.2019.1605683
- Afzal, A., Mirza, N., Arshad, F.: Market discipline in South Asia: evidence from commercial banking sector. Int. J. Financ. Econ. 26(2), 2251–2262 (2021). https://doi.org/10.1002/ijfe. 1904
- Arellano, M., Bond, S.: Some tests of specification for panel data: Monte Carlo evidence and an application to employment equations. Rev. Econ. Stud. (1991). https://doi.org/10.2307/229 7968
- Baker, M., Wurgler, J.: Do strict capital requirements raise the cost of capital? Bank regulation, capital structure, and the low risk anomaly. Am. Econ. Rev. (2015). https://doi.org/10.1257/ aer.p20151092
- Basel Committee on Banking Supervision: International convergence of capital measurement and capital standards: a revised framework & comprehensive version. In: Bank for International Settlements (Issue June) (2006)
- Benink, H., Wihlborg, C.: The new Basel capital accord: making it effective with stronger market discipline. Eur. Financ. Manag. 8(1), 103–115 (2002). https://doi.org/10.1111/1468-036X.00178
- BIS: Basel III—international regulatory framework for banks. Bank for International Settlements (2011)
- 8. Bliss, R.R., Flannery, M.J.: Market discipline in the governance of U.S. bank holding companies: monitoring vs. influencing. Rev. Finance 6(3), 361–396 (2002). https://doi.org/10.1023/a:1022021430852

- Covitz, D.M., Hancock, D., Kwast, M.L.: Market discipline in banking reconsidered: the roles of funding manager decisions and deposit insurance reform. Finance Econ. Discuss. Ser. 2004(53), 1–43 (2004). https://doi.org/10.17016/feds.2004.53
- Crockett, A.: Market discipline and financial stability. J. Bank. Finance 26(5), 977–987 (2002). https://doi.org/10.1016/S0378-4266(01)00265-5
- Czum, J.M.: Dive into deep learning. J. Am. Coll. Radiol. (2020). https://doi.org/10.1016/j. jacr.2020.02.005
- De Mendonça, H.F.: Market discipline in the Brazilian banking industry: an analysis for the subordinated debt holders. J. Regul. Econ., 286–307 (2009). https://doi.org/10.1007/s11149-009-9098-z
- 13. Demirgüç-Kunt, A., Huizinga, H.: Market discipline and deposit insurance. Statist. Probab. Lett. 66(4), 375–399 (2004). https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jmoneco.2003.04.001
- Distinguin, I., Kouassi, T., Tarazi, A.: Interbank deposits and market discipline: evidence from Central and Eastern Europe. J. Comp. Econ. 41(2), 544–560 (2013). https://doi.org/10.1016/j. jce.2012.07.005
- Flannery, M.J.: The faces of "market discipline." J. Financ. Serv. Res. 20(2–3), 107–119 (2001). https://doi.org/10.1023/A:1012455806431
- Ghosh, S., Das, A.: Market Discipline in the Indian Banking Sector: An Empirical Exploration. NSE Research Initiative, NSE, Mumbai, May, 1–19 (2003)
- Godspower-akpomiemie, E., Ojah, K.: Market discipline, regulation and banking effectiveness: do measures. J. Bank. Finance 133, 106249 (2021). https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbankfin.2021. 106249
- Hadad, M.D., Agusman, A., Monroe, G.S., Gasbarro, D., Zumwalt, J.K.: Market discipline, financial crisis and regulatory changes: evidence from Indonesian banks. J. Bank. Finance 35(6), 1552–1562 (2011). https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbankfin.2010.11.003
- Hamalainen, P., Hall, M., Howcroft, B.: A framework for market discipline in bank regulatory design. J. Bus. Financ. Acc. 32(1–2), 183–209 (2005). https://doi.org/10.1111/j.0306-686X. 2005.00592.x
- Hasan, I., Jackowicz, K., Kowalewski, O., Kozłowski, Ł.: Market discipline during crisis: evidence from bank depositors in transition countries. J. Bank. Finance 37(12), 5436–5451 (2013). https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbankfin.2013.06.007
- Hastie, T., Tibshirani, R., Friedman, J.: The Elements of Statistical Learning the Elements of Statistical Learning Data Mining, Inference, and Prediction, 2nd edn. Springer series in statistics (2009). https://doi.org/10.1007/978-0-387-84858-7
- 22. Hastie, T., Tibshirani, R., Wainwright, M.: Statistical learning with sparsity: the lasso and generalizations. In: Statistical Learning with Sparsity: The Lasso and Generalizations (2015). https://doi.org/10.1201/b18401
- Hoang, K.T.A., Faff, R., Haq, M.: Market discipline and bank risk taking. Aust. J. Manag. 39(3), 327–350 (2014). https://doi.org/10.1177/0312896213496800
- 24. Le, T.D.: Market discipline and the regulatory change: evidence from Vietnam. Cogent Econ. Finance 8(1) (2020). https://doi.org/10.1080/23322039.2020.1757801
- Miadalyni, D. (Desi), Dewi, S.K. (Sayu).: Pengaruh Loan to Deposit Ratio, Loan to Asset Ratio, Capital Adequacy Ratio Dan Kualitas Aktiva Produktif Terhadap Profitabilitas Pada PT Bank Pembangunan Daerah Bali Kantor Pusat Denpasar. E-Jurnal Manajemen Universitas Udayana2(12), 248916 (2013)
- Nahar, S., Azim, M., Jubb, C.: The determinants of risk disclosure by banking institutions evidence from Bangladesh. Asian Rev. Account. 24(4), 426–444 (2016). https://doi.org/10. 1108/ARA-07-2014-0075
- 27. Nier, E., Baumann, U.: Market discipline, disclosure and moral hazard in banking. J. Financ. intermediation 15(3), 332–361 (2006). https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jfi.2006.03.001
- Sironi, A.: Testing for market discipline in the European banking industry: evidence from subordinated debt issues. J. Money Credit Bank. 35(3), 443–472 (2003). https://doi.org/10. 2139/ssrn.249284

- 29. Tibshirani, R.: Regression shrinkage and selection via the Lasso. J. Roy. Stat. Soc.: Ser. B (Methodol.) 58(1), 267–288 (1996). https://doi.org/10.1111/j.2517-6161.1996.tb02080.x
- 30. Tibshirani, R.: Regression shrinkage and selection via the lasso: a retrospective. J. R. Stat. Soc. Ser. B Stat Methodol. (2011). https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-9868.2011.00771.x
- 31. Uchida, H., Satake, M.: Market discipline and bank efficiency. J. Int. Finan. Markets. Inst. Money 19(5), 792–802 (2009). https://doi.org/10.1016/j.intfin.2009.02.003
- 32. Wuryandani, G., Ginting, R., Iskandar, D., Sitompul, Z.: Fund management and the liquidity of the bank. Buletin Ekonomi Moneter Dan Perbankan **16**(3) (2014). https://doi.org/10.21098/bemp.v16i3.446
- Yan, X., Skully, M.T., Avram, K., Vu, T.: Credit unions, market discipline, and the Australian deposit guarantee. SSRN (2015). https://doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.2651962
- 34. Dietz, M., Nadeau, M.C., Ferreira, N., Sengupta, J.: McKinsey Global Banking Annual Review. The great divergence (2021). https://www.mckinsey.com/~/media/mckinsey/industries/financial%20services/our%20insights/global%20banking%20annual%20review%202021%20the%20great%20divergence/global-banking-annualreview-2021-the-great-divergence-final.pdf